THE MEANING OF THE WORD "QAWWAMUN": SEMIOTIC ANLYSIS OF JULIA KRISTEVA'S INTERTEXTUALITY IN TAFSIR AL-MIZAN AND TAFSIR AL-MISHBAH

Muhammad Syaikhul Arif
Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University, Yogyakarta
Msyaikhularif2@gmail.com

Alifatul Lusiana Uswatun Chasanah
Gadjah Mada University, Yogyakarta
alifatullusianauswatunchasanah@mail.ugm.ac.id

Jawahir Kamal
Universitas Al-Azhar Kairo
Jawahirkamal6@gmail.com

Abstract

Nowadays, women leadership has become a much-discussed topic. However, in practice, it still leaves many gaps that need to be continuously improved and applied on a large scale. Society's restrictive perspective on leadership, which insists that it must be carried out by men, is a product of centuries of indoctrination by patriarchal culture, continually reproduced by various groups, including religious authorities. Islamic legal products are the result of interpretations of Quranic verses, so if bias exists in the interpretation process, biases will also manifest in legal products and the general understanding of society. To gain a new perspective in understanding leadership, this research aims to explore the shift in the meaning of 'qawwamun' by examining the viewpoints of two Quranic commentators whose works are interconnected but produce two different perspectives, allowing us to conclude that there has been a change in their ideological stance

Keywords: *Intertextuality; Semiotic; Women Leadership*

Introduction

When looking at role models in terms of leaders, most people will refer to men as leaders, even though the existence of women as leaders cannot actually be denied. In the development of leadership from time to time, various female leaders have emerged in the world and specifically in Indonesia. In various sectors, it is also inevitable that the presence of women as holders of the highest positions is inevitable. Indonesia itself has a history of leadership by a female president, and several other important positions have been occupied by women in the executive, legislative and judicial sectors.

Indonesia is a country that is ranked second in terms of the largest Muslim population, so the existence of the Quran as the main guide for Muslims is very vital. Tafsir of the Quran as a derivative or explanation of the meaning of the Quran occupies an authoritative position, especially when it comes to leadership discussions. Efforts to struggle for authority over the meaning of interpretation need to be highlighted, because the results of the interpretation will then become legal products that are practiced by society. So, a deeper discussion is needed regarding the interpretation of the meaning of the word qawwamun as leader, because of the attachment between men in discussions of leadership which has been used and considered as doctrine for a long time. So, to provide opportunities and legal standing for women's leadership based on the arguments of the Quran, it is necessary to see a change in the meaning of the word qawwamun.

To this day, many ulama' and mufassir have different views regarding the discussions of leadership from a gender perspective, and they seem to be divided into two groups; those who disagree on women's leadership and those who agree on women's leadership. Those who disagree and reject women's position on leadership mostly only refer to the literal meaning of QS an-Nisa' verse 34, arguing that men have superiority in terms of opinion, management, superior in physical and mental strength, and so on. (Munawar 2002) While on the

other hand, those who agree and support leadership of women are based on many considerations, as Nasaruddin Umar argues that there is not a single verse or hadith that can be used as a basis for prohibiting women from participating in the politics sector and holding the highest position of a leader. (Umar et al. 1999)

In an attempt to provide an alternative perspective for Muslims regarding the issue of women's leadership, it is necessary to review the term *qawwamun* in Q.S an-Nisa' verse 34. This article will present the views of Quraish Shihab and compare it with the interpreter's interpretation which is used as a reference and quotation in the tafsir al-Mishbah; the tafsir al-Mizan by Husayn Thabathaba'i. Although Quraish Shihab on several occasions quoted Thabathaba'i's views – which were often considered less relevant to the Indonesian Muslim community which is predominantly Sunni – in their interpretation of the topic of leadership, these two mufassir raised two different views. (Jamal 2011) To see the shifted meaning that occurs between these two interconnected works of tafsir – since Quraish Shihab quoted Thabathaba'i – this article uses the theory of intertextuality developed by Julia Kristeva with the assumption that a text cannot stand alone without the existence of another text to support.

Discussions regarding women's leadership in the Quran have been widely discussed in several previous literature. Study by Lujeng Lutfiyah with the title Kepemimpinan Perempuan Dalam Al-Qur'an Kajian Tafsir Tematik or Women's Leadership in the Al-Qur'an Thematic Tafsir Study. (Lutfiyah and Diyanah 2022) This study uses the thematic interpretation method to explain the verses on women's leadership. Study by Lutfiyah discusses the pros and cons of female leadership that will always exist from time to time regarding the different results of ulama's ijtihad, and this situation is considered as normalFurthermore, a study by Muhammad Mizan with the title Kepemimpinan Perempuan Dalam Al-Quran: Studi Komparasi Tafsir Al-Azhar Dan Tafsir An-Nur or Women's Leadership in the Al-

Quran: Comparative Study of Tafsir Al-Azhar and Tafsir An-Nur.(Mizan, Arif Firdausi N.R, and Muhammad Mukharom Ridho 2024)

Previous study by Mizan discusses women's leadership from the perspective of two mufassir; Buya Hamka and Hasbie Ash-Shidqie. This study argues that there is no explicit argument that prohibits women's leadership in the public sector or government. Lastly, study by Dewanti Nabilah Putri with the title Kepemimpinan Perempuan dalam Tafsir At-Tabari dan Tafsir Al-Mishbāh or Women's Leadership in Tafsir At-Tabari and Tafsir Al-Mishbāh.(Putri, Taufiq, and Izzan 2024) This study describes the interpretations of at-Thabari and Quraish Shihab and compares both works. The discussion in this study presents at-Thabari's argument regarding leadership as a man's task, while Quraish Shihab's argument allows women to lead in spaces other than the domestic space.

The topic discussion of this paper has significant differences from previous works. This article will examine the interpretation of the term qawwamun in Q.S an-Nisa' verse 34, through two mufassir perspectives that are related but have significantly different interpretation results, namely Muhammad Husain Thabathaba'i and Muhammad Quraish Shihab. This article will also attempt to dissect the views of both mufassir using the theory of intertextuality analysis developed by Julia Kristeva, so it will be able to draw conclusions from the results of this analysis.

Method

To make the discussion deeper and clear, this paper uses a literature study using comparative analytical descriptive methods. As a theoretical framework, this paper uses the theory of intertextuality developed by Julia Kristeva. The primary reference sources in this article are from Tafsir al-Mizan by Husain Thabathaba'i and Tafsir al-Mishbah by M. Quraish Shihab. Meanwhile, secondary data in this research is from journals, books, scientific articles and other texts that

support deeper research.(Sugiyono and Lestari 2021) The discussion steps in this article include discussing intertextual theory by Julia Kristeva, a discussion of Tafsir al-Mizan by Husain Thabathaba'i and Tafsir al-Mishbah by M. Quraish Shihab, and continued with a description and comparison between the two tafsir works, and finally applying Julia Kristeva's Intertextual theory as data analysis.

Result and Discussion

Julia Kristeva and the Theory of Intertextuality

Julia Kristeva is a French post-structuralist philosopher who was born on June 24, 1941 AD, in Bulgaria. His flow of French post-structuralism is rooted in his journey of knowledge, when at the age of 24 he studied in France and pursued a career until he developed there. Kristeva is a linguist, literary critic, theorist, philosopher, and feminist. More than that, Kristeva is also a psychoanalyst and novelist. His life in Paris gave way to life as a thinker and writer. He attended Roland Barthes' seminar and joined and was involved in the intellectual life of writers whose center was around the famous literary journal, Tel Quel.(Taufiq 2017)

Kristeva's ideas regarding intertextual theory are contained in her work entitled "Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art." In her theory, Kristeva does not just compare two different works then considers the earlier work as a hypogram of the work that follows. In another sense, as in many previous studies, there are still many considerations that a work that comes later is interpreted as a reception of an existing work. So, intertextual theory not only discusses the influence between related authors, but also goes further than that. (Kristeva 1982)

Intertextual theory by Kristeva states that in a text space there are various types of utterances taken from other texts. These texts are related to each other, intersect with each other, and neutralize each other. Thus, a text is built from several variables or textual pieces that

can be known through a work. The pieces of text cannot be viewed as separate variables, but must be understood as a unit that supports each other. Kristeva called this an ideologeme. Kristeva considers intertextuality as a study analysis tool to see ideology in a literary work. Many Muslim scholars have adopted intertextuality as an analytical tool; both to reinterpret the meaning of the Quran and to study previous interpretations. (Kaelan 2009)

Kristeva's view on literary works is as semiotic practices that have patterns united by several utterances or expressions that can be read. In this case, the ideologem that Kristeva means is the ability to understand changes in expression or speech that are manifested in a text - which cannot be further divided or reduced - over the entire text. Kristeva defines ideologeme as a combination of a text arrangement expressed through speech, so that the speech is assimilated into its own space or interior text and then refers to the outer space of the text or exterior text. (Nasri 2017)

The concept of text as a form of ideology must be associated with a semiotic procedure that studies texts as an intertextual study, it means requiring the text to be based on a social and historical narrative. This also means that pieces of text in the form of speech in a text have a connection between the text itself or interior text and things outside the text or exterior text. This has similarities with the existence of social texts in society. The ideology of a text can be known through three processes; opposition, transposition, and finally transformation. The explanation of those three is explained through the following description:

1. Opposition is something that cannot be exchanged with each other and it is absolutely between two groups of things that are mutually contradictory, competing, non-complementary and irreconcilable.

2. Transposition is the shifted text from one or more sign systems to another sign system, which is accompanied by the existence of new speech. This refers to how a sign system is internalized into another sign system, and includes things that are related to semiotic

transformation as a result of the transposition itself. For example, a speech or text that moves from a connotative position to a denotative position. So, language is a code that has no boundaries. Furthermore, transposition includes four meanings; subtraction, replacement, addition and rearrangement of letters contained in a word or sentence. 3. Transformation is a condition when there is a change in form between one text and another text. This means that a text is read by a writer, then the writer inserts his own understanding into text and rewrites this new understanding of the text in his writing, which then changes from what was originally diachronic to synchronic. (Kristeva 2013).

Tafsir by Husain Thabathaba'i and Quraish Shihab

Muhammad Husain Thabathaba'i and Tafsir al-Mizan

Born with the full name Muhammad Husain Ibn Muhammad ibn Muhammad Husain ibn 'Ali ibn al-Hasan al-Musanna ibn al-Hasan ibn 'Ali bin Abi Talib, he is more often known to the general public as Husain Tabathaba'i because of his blood relationship with Ibrahim who known as Tabathaba'i, or also known as al-Hasani, because it is attributed to al-Hasan ibn 'Ali. Born in the city of Tabriz on 29 Dzhulhijjah in 1321 Hijriah, or coincidentally in 1892 AD. He was a famous former Shiite minister and received the nickname *'allamah*, which means very shrewd.

Tabathaba'i grew up in a well-known family, namely the Thabathaba'i family who were descendants of al-Hasan bin Ali. This family also received the nickname *al-Qâdhî*. Thabathaba'i was abandoned by his father and mother from a very early age, with details of his father dying when he was nine years old, and his mother when he was five years old. Since his parents died, Tabathaba'i was raised by his servants, one woman and one man. (Tabatabai 2010)

Thabathaba'i began his education in the city of Tabriz, which is his hometown. He received scientific instruction in the basics of

religion under the auspices of his extended family, as well as religious leaders from his group. After going through basic education, he moved and settled in the city of Najaf in Iraq in 1343 Hijri to study religion for ten years. Najaf al-Asyraf is a center for the study of Islamic sciences. Thabathaba'i left for the city of Najaf to continue his college education at the age of twenty at the Shiite University. (Baidowi 2024)

Thabathaba'i continued to study ushul and fiqh from two famous ulama figures, namely Shaykh Muhammad Husain al-Kimyani and Shaykh Muhammad Husain an-Na'ini. In the field of metaphysics and philosophy, he studied with Sayyid Hussain al-Badkubi who was a famous intellectual in the field of philosophy at that time. Thabathaba'i also studied arithmetic and mathematics from Sayyid Abi al-Qasim al-Khwansari.(Rakhmat 2000)

Thabathaba'i began his work as a source person in the field of Quran interpretation when he had finished his studies and moved to the city of Qum, which at that time was the center of Islamic religious knowledge in Iran. At that time there were no studies in the field of interpretation and philosophy, so Thabathaba'i became one of the early pioneers in the study of interpretation and philosophy. After that, Tabathaba'i began to be known as an 'alim and became one of the central figures in the city of Qum. After establishing himself as a great figure in Islamic sciences, many people came to follow his studies, including Murtadhâ Muthahhariî who later became one of the great figures.(Tabatabai 1997)

Thabathaba'i passed away on Sunday, Muharram 18, 1402 Hijriah in the city of Qum. Thabathaba'i passed away after suffering from a long illness. His funeral was attended by hundreds of thousands of people, including major figures from various circles; ulama', officials, to fighters and religious activists. Quoting the statement of 'Abdullah Syirazi who was one of his students; that the day of Thabathaba'i's death is celebrated as a holiday and a day of

mourning as a reward and a form of great respect for Thabathaba'i.(Baidowi 2024)

Tafsir al-Mizan is one of the tafsir books that is interesting to look at because even though Thabathaba'i comes from the Shia group, his work still references and uses references not only from Shia books. Tabathaba'i also uses references to books by Sunni scholars. Because of this attitude of objectivity, it is not uncommon for his interpretations to be used as a reference by Sunni scholars in the modern era. Tabataba'i uses analytical methods in its tafsir by ordering the tafsir according to the order of the Qur'an from surah al-Fatihah to an-Nas. This method is quite widely used in interpretive books in the classical and contemporary eras. Apart from that, Tabathaba'i also uses the method of interpreting verses with other verses. This method is used as the main method in this book of interpretation.

Third, Tabathaba'i also criticized Muslim philosophers. Thabathaba'i argues that Muslim philosophers use the Quran as an affirmation of postulates in the field of philosophy so that they interpret verses that are not in accordance with philosophical tendencies. Fourth, are the Sufis. Due to the Sufi's tendency towards inner knowledge, they only attribute the meaning of the Quran to inner matters only. In fact, the Quran should be able to be understood in a holistic way. Fifth, Tabataba'i criticizes the modern era school of thought which tends to focus on sensory matters so that it tends to recite verses that cannot be found in common ground with sensory matters, such as *arsy*, chairs, *lauhul mahfuz*, and so on. Tabataba'i concluded that these methods were not tafsir, it was *tathbiq*; namely the application of certain discoveries from outside the Quran to its verses. Thus, there is a shift in meaning from tafsir to *tathbiq*, and vice versa.(Tabatabai t.th)

M. Quraish Shihab and Tafsir al-Mishbah

Prof. Dr. AG. K.H. Al-Habib Muhammad Quraish Shihab, Lc., M.A., or Prof. Quraish Shihab is an Indonesian Muslim scholar

as well as a professor in the field of Al-Quran Tafsir and Science. Shihab was born in Rappang, South Sulawesi in 1944 AD. Shihab is a person of mixed Arab-Bugis blood with the surname Shihab, and comes from an educated family. His father; Prof. Abdurrahman Shihab is a scholar and professor in the field of Tafsir. His father was also listed as a chancellor at two state and private college, namely the Alauddin State Islamic Institute (IAIN) in Ujung Pandang and the Indonesian Muslim University (UMI).(Shihab 1992)

In between his busy schedule as a professor and rector, Abdurrahman Shihab still spends time giving religious advice to his sons and daughters, which often takes the form of verses from the Quran.(Shihab 1997) From the advice he quoted from the verses of the Quran, hadith, and the words of Islamic scholars and Islamic religious experts that Abdurrahman Shihab gave to his children. He provided motivation and a strong religious foundation for his children, especially Quraish Shihab. Which made this the beginning of the growth of the seeds of love for the field that he is still devoted to, namely the field of Quranic tafsir.(Roziqin, Asti, and Munif 2009)

Quraish Shihab, in his work since first publishing al-Mishbah in 2001, has been considered the most well-known contemporary Indonesian mufassir, so it cannot be denied that ordinary people know today's Indonesian mufassir better by his name. Even though in reality Quriash Shihab is not the only interpreter and expert of the Quran in Indonesia, his skill in interpreting and conveying the contents of the Quran in the context of today or the postmodern era makes him better known to the wider community compared to other Quran experts.

Shihab places a lot of emphasis on further understanding of revelation of Allah from a contextual perspective, and not just focusing on the textual verses only. This aims to suitably apply the meaning contained in the message of the verses of the Quran in the reality of social life. Shihab also gave a lot of advice and motivation to his students, especially at postgraduate level, so that they have the

courage to interpret the verses of the Quran. Shihab based his argument on the fact that many interpretations correlate with the rapid development of science and the demands of modern progress.

However, Shihab emphasizes the importance of being careful and thorough in doing interpretation, in order to not to easily claim one's own opinion as the opinion of the Quran. Furthermore, Shihab considers someone who imposes one's own opinion in the name of the Quran as a major sin.(Nata 2005) Furthermore, the contextual approach that Shihab means is an approach that is oriented towards the context of the interpreter's existence and the context that includes the text of the verse. This form of approach also looks at the socio-historical background of the text's emergence and becomes an urgent variable. Then it is brought to the context of the time when the interpreter was located, which also includes time, place, socio-cultural conditions and history. Therefore, the nature of the movement is from bottom to top or from the context into the text.(Gusmian 2003)

Shihab in compiling the work of tafsir al-Mishbah has his own style of interpretation in the form of *adabi al-ijtimā'i*; which refers to the style of interpretation that attempts to interpret the verses of the Quran by explaining the expressions contained in the Quran in detail. Next, he explains the meaning of the Quran using interesting and beautiful language. Next, the interpreter or mufassir attempts to correlate the text of the Quran studied with the reality of social conditions. This refers to the existing cultural system. This style of interpretation does not only emphasize one particular style, such as Islamic interpretation, scientific interpretation, *fiqih* interpretation, *lughawi* interpretation, or Sufi interpretation. Furthermore, this type of interpretation emphasizes the socio-cultural needs of the existing community.(Munawwir 2005)

Using this type of interpretation creates a special attraction for readers and can foster love for the Quran, and can motivate the beginning of further exploration of the secrets and meaning of the Quran. In line with what was conveyed by Husein al-Dzahabi that

regardless of the shortcomings of *adabi al-ijtimā'i*, this interpretive model attempts to explain the miracles and beauty of the language of the Quran, explain the meaning contained in the Quran, reveal the natural laws contained in the Quran, and try to solve the problems faced by Muslims by combining the Quran with scientific theories, both social and scientific. (al-Farmawy 2002)

Interpretation of "Qawwamûn" in Tafsir al-Mizan and Tafsir al-Mishbah

Tafsir al-Mizan

Discussion regarding the term *'qawwamûn'* in QS. An-nisa verse 34 has become an interesting discussion among the Quran experts. Each interpreter has a different meaning regarding a man's leadership towards a woman. Including Husain At-Thabataba'i in tafsir al-Mizan. The term *'qawwamûn'* comes from the word *qiyam*, means someone who supports others. Meanwhile, *qawwam* is the *mubalaghah* or hyperbolic form of the word *qiyam*. The plural form of *qawwam* is *qawwamun*, in accordance with the plural diction used in the QS. An-nisa verse 34; *ar-Rijalu*. Thabataba'i explained that the cause of the superiority that exists from this meaning is related to the character of a man who has skills in reasoning and other things such as physical strength and superior potential in work and so on. (Tabatabai t.th)

Tabataba'i argues that men's superiority over women is general. This means that it is not limited to marital relations, but covers all aspects of society's social life, including government. Tabataba'i stated that affairs of the people, such as war and court, require aspects of reason and reasoning which require an attitude of weakening the aspects of feelings in humans. The dominance of reasoning over feelings is relied upon and thought to exist in a man, not a woman.

Tabataba'i strengthens his argument by looking at history that proves this argument. Rasulullah SAW never gave court duties to women and never ordered women to fight. Instead, it allows women to do other work such as medicine and teaching. This is because the dominance of women's feelings does not have a significant influence in professions such as fighting and so on. This is used as an excuse regarding the suitability of a man to be a leader compared to a woman. Including leadership in terms of organizations, regions and even countries.(Tabatabai t.th)

Tafsir al-Mishbah

The word *qawwamun* (قَوَّٰمُونَ) is the plural of the word *qawwam* (قَوَّٰم), which comes from the word *qama* (قام). This word is related to the command for prayer, which according to Quraish Shihab also uses the root word *qama*. The command to pray is not an order to perform prayers, but rather to carry them out perfectly by fulfilling various conditions, pillars and sunnahs of prayer. A person who carries out tasks or whatever other people expect of him is called a *qa'im* (قَائِم). If someone performs a task perfectly, continuously and repeatedly, it is called *qawwam* (قَوَّٰم). This verse uses the plural form, so the word *qawwamun* (قَوَّٰمُونَ) is in harmony with the word *ar-rijal* (ٱلرِّجَالُ) which means men emphasizing men as the plural form.

According to Quraish Shihab, this word is often translated as leader. But he also referred to what he had explained regarding the basic form of the word *qawwamun* and the translation was not able to provide a picture or represent the desired meaning. Although on the one hand it must still be acknowledged that leadership is an aspect contained in it. In other words, according to Shihab, the word "leadership" includes efforts to fulfill needs, care, guidance, attention and advocacy.(Shihab 2017)

Shihab also explained that leadership is the ability to influence other parties so that they can be directed, either consciously

or not, towards the desired goals or interests. Everyone can have this ability, regardless of whether they are male or female. For example, in the family, a woman is able to exert influence to produce decisions in the family. It shows how leadership is not immediately given absolutely to men only. Shihab also added that women should always improve their own quality in order to be able to play a significant role in the family.(Shihab 2015)

In conveying a psychological perspective, Shihab argued that women have a tendency to like working and being supervised by other people. Women understand that the expression they have can be influential and can be a need for other people. Thus, women tend to be the ones who support and are led, while men emphasize more on rationality and are therefore more likely to lead.(Shihab 2017) However, even though men and women have different tendencies, "tendencies" cannot be used as a final benchmark for the role line of a man or a woman. Thus, Quraish Shihab views that men's leadership over women is limited to the family sphere and is not comprehensive in matters outside this scope. Lastly, Quraish Shihab agreed on the role of women in any leadership positions in various levels of society.

Comparison of the Interpretation of "Qawwamûn" in Tafsir al-Mizan and Tafsir al-Mishbah

After knowing the interpretation of the term "qawwamun" according to Tabataba'i, it is necessary to compare the results of the interpretation by Quraish Shihab so we can find out what are the similarities and differences between both mufassir in interpreting the verse. The similarity between the both Shihab and Tabataba'i that men's superiority over women is naturally established. A man's character is indeed stronger in terms of physical and logical reasoning. Both of them also agree that a man's life tends to prioritize reasoning over feelings. On the other hand, both of them also agree that women's lives tend to prioritize feelings over reasoning.

However, Quraish Shihab sees the softness and sensitivity of women's feelings not as a 'weakness', but as an advantage in certain areas, such as in the case of educating children. So it is not surprising that a mother is always the most comfortable place for a child to go home. Furthermore, Tabataba'i interprets men's superiority over women as an excuse to make men more reliable leaders and this is different from how Quraish Shihab interprets the word qawwamun. Even though this word is often translated to mean leader, Quraish Shihab – referring to the basic form of word qawwamun – argues that this word is not yet able to provide a picture or represent the desired meaning, although on the one hand it must still be acknowledged that leadership is an aspect contained in it. In other words, according to Quraish Shihab the word "leadership" includes efforts to fulfill needs, care, guidance, attention and advocacy. (Shihab 2017)

From this comparison, we can conclude that Tabataba'i expands the meaning of family leadership to community leadership and the general public. Meanwhile, Quraish Shihab expanded this meaning beyond the leadership aspect only. Thus, the meaning brought by Quraish Shihab regarding the diction of 'qawwamun' is broader than that brought by Husain At-Thabataba'i.

Intertextuality Analysis Julia Kristeva

In applying the theory of intertextuality, it is necessary to locate and determine which genotext and which phenotext are useful for tracking shifts in the meaning of *qawwamun*. Tafsir al-Mizan by Husain Thabataba'i was placed as genotext, and Tafsir al-Mishbah by M. Quraish Shihab was determined as phenotext based on the argument that Quraish Shihab in compiling his tafsir often quoted Husain Thabataba'i's work. After placing both of them in the specified position, the next step was to analyze the two texts, and it was found that there had been a shift in meaning between the two.

Quraish Shihab in his interpretation has added information to the meaning of the word *qawwamun*, by referring it to efforts to

fulfill needs, maintenance, guidance, attention and defense, at this point we can see that a modification has occurred. Quraish Shihab also broadened the context of the discussion by adding views other than those of Islamic scholars and thinkers, such as statements from male and female psychologists. This indicates an expansion point. As for tracing Ideolegeme, it can be concluded that the interpretation of Quraish Shihab is categorized as transposition, means taking elements or ideas from the original text and inserting them into a new text, including additions, subtractions, replacements and rearrangements of meaning.

Husain Thabataba'i's efforts to interpret meaning were carried out by placing women and men in the same position of rights and obligations. However, in the topic of discussing women's leadership, he saw that women had no ability to lead, and that it was an absolute requirement for men to lead. According to Thabataba'i, fiqh scholars have agreed that the position of Imam or head must be a man. This shift in meaning can show that in an effort to reinterpret the term *qawwamun*, Quraish Shihab does not hesitate to add various views so the meaning is not limited to the superiority of men over women. But on the one hand it still provides an opportunity for anyone to lead as long as they can fulfill their obligations as a leader according to the meaning of the word *qawwamun* which he interprets.

Conclusion

From the description above, a conclusion can be drawn that the two mufassir appointed in this paper actually have several points of similarity and significant differences. In general, both agree that both men and women have the same rights and obligations. However, when the discussion focuses on the meaning of the word *qawwamun* and its manifestation for women's leadership, the differences appear. Husain Thabataba'i, who in his interpretation tends to be textual, views and understands the text literally, so his interpretation does not provide space for women to lead. This point is much significantly different from Quraish Shihab who interpreted the word *qawwamun*

more broadly and added meanings to not just stop at the leader's translation. According to Shihab, anyone can become a leader as long as has the ability to fulfill the duties and responsibilities of a leader and is able to take responsibility as the main task assigned to a leader.

If the discussion of this paper is analyzed using Kristeva's intertextuality lens, the interpretation of al-Mizan is positioned as the genotext and the interpretation of al-Mishbah as the phenotext. It can be seen that there have been modifications and expansions that can be seen from the different discussion of Quraish Shihab and Husain Thabataba'i and while Shihab's explanation is broader by adding the views of experts other than ulama' and mufassir. Furthermore, it can be understood that the meaning of Quraish Shihab is a transposition category; namely taking elements or ideas from the original text and inserting them into the new text. Likewise, additions, subtractions, replacements and rearrangements of meaning occur.

References

Baidowi, Ahmad. 2024. *Mengenal Thabathaba'I dan Kontroversi Nasikh Mansukh*. Bandung: Nuansa Cendekia.

al-Farmawy, Abdul Hayy. 2002. *Metode Tafsir Dan Cara Penerapannya*. Bandung: Pustaka Setia.

Gusmian, Islah. 2003. *Khazanah Tafsir Indonesia: dari Hermeneutika hingga ideologi*. Jakarta: Teraju.

Jamal, Khairunnas. 2011. "Pengaruh Pemikiran Husain Thabathaba'i Dalam Tafsir Al Mishbah." *Jurnal Ushuluddin* 17(2):202–13.

Kaelan. 2009. *Filsafat Bahasa, Semiotika dan Hermeneutika*. Yogyakarta: Paradigma.

Kristeva, Julia. 1982. *Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art*. edited by L. S. R. T. by Th. Columbia University Press.

Kristeva, Julia. 2013. *Teori Sastra Dan Julia Kristeva*. terj. Sunaryono Basuki Ks. Bali: CV. Bali Media Adhikarsa.

Lutfiyah, Lujeng, and Lubabah Diyanah. 2022. "Kepemimpinan Perempuan Dalam Al-Qur'an Kajian Tafsir Tematik." *Al Furqan: Jurnal Ilmu Al Quran Dan Tafsir* 5(2):270–87. doi:10.58518/alfurqon.v5i2.1399.

Mizan, Muhammad, Arif Firdausi N.R, and Muhammad Mukharom Ridho. 2024. "Kepemimpinan Perempuan Dalam Al-Quran : Studi Komparasi Tafsir Al-Azhar Dan Tafsir An-Nur." *Al Furqan: Jurnal Ilmu Al Quran Dan Tafsir* 7(1):72–91. doi:10.58518/alfurqon.v7i1.2541.

Munawar, Said Aqil Husin Al. 2002. *Al-Qur'an Membangun Tradisi Kesalehan Hakiki*. Jakarta: Ciputat Press.

Munawwir, Fajrul. 2005. *Pendekatan Kajian Tafsir*. Yogyakarta: Teras.

Nasri, Daratullaila. 2017. "OPOSISI TEKS ANAK DAN KEMENAKAN KARYA MARAH RUSLI: KAJIAN INTERTEKSTUAL JULIA KRISTEVA." *Kandai* 3(2):205–22.

Nata, Abuddin. 2005. *Tokoh-Tokoh Pembaruan Pendidikan Islam di Indonesia*. Jakarta: RajaGrafindo Persada.

Putri, Deswanti Nabilah, Wildan Taufiq, and Ahmad Izzan. 2024. "Kepemimpinan Perempuan Dalam Tafsir At-Tabari Dan Tafsir Al-Mishbāh." *Mashadiruna Jurnal Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Tafsir* 3(1):61–74. doi:10.15575/mjiat.v3i1.33962.

Rakhmat, Jalaluddin. 2000. *Tafsir Sufi Al-Fatihah Mukadimah*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.

Roziqin, Badiatul, Badiatul Muchlisin Asti, and Junaidi Abdul Munif. 2009. *101 Jejak Tokoh Islam Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: e-Nusantara.

Shihab, Alwi. 1997. *Islam Inklusif: Menuju Sikap Terbuka dalam Beragama*. Bandung: Mizan.

Shihab, M. Quraish. 1992. *Membumikan Al-Qur'an*. Bandung: Mizan.

Shihab, M. Quraish. 2017. *Tafsir Al-Mishbah: Pesan, Kesan, Dan Keserasian al-Qur'an*. Tangerang: Lentera Hati.

Shihab, Muhammad Quraish. 2015. *Tafsîr Al-Mishbâẖ*. Ed. rev. Tangerang: Lentera Haiti.

Sugiyono, Sugiyono, and Puji Lestari. 2021. *Metode Penelitian Komunikasi (Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, Dan Cara Mudah Menulis Artikel Pada Jurnal Internasional)*. Bandung: CV Alvabeta Bandung.

Tabatabai, Muẖammad Husain. 1997. *Mengungkap Rahasia Al-Qur'an*. terj. A. Malik Mandaniy dan Hamim Ilyas. Bandung: Mizan.

Tabatabai, Muẖammad Husain. 2010. *Tafsir Al-Mizan*. terj. Ilyas Hasan. Jakarta: Lentera.

Tabatabai, Muẖammad Husain. t.th. *Al-Mizan Fi Tafsir al-Qur'an*. Vol. 1. Beirut: Muassasah al-A'lami li al-Mathbua't.

Taufiq, Wildan. 2017. *Semiotika Untuk Kajian Sastra Dan Al-Qur`an.* Bandung: Yrama Widya.

Umar, N., J. Effendi, M. Anwar, Asia Foundation, Solidaritas Perempuan (Organization), and Lembaga Kajian Agama dan Jender. 1999. *Kodrat Perempuan Dalam Islam.* Lembaga Kajian Agama dan Jender, Solidaritas Perempuan, The Asia Foundation.